The Territorial Community Digital Transformation Index in Ukraine

Methodology
Table of Contents

Glossary

01 About the Index
   Introduction
   The TCDTI structure
   Classification of territorial communities
   Description of the TC digital maturity levels
   Use of the measurement results

02 Measurement Stages
   General process map
   Parties involved in the measurement process
   Data sources and data collection principles
   Measurement of the annual digital development dynamics
   Preparation of the TC digital maturity rating
   Ongoing monitoring of TCDTI and approach to its updating

03 Refined Structure of the Index

04 Approaches to weighting TCDTI groups and indicators.
   Determination of their target values

Annexes
   Annex 01. Recommendations on Risks Management
   Annex 02. Pilot Measurement Results
## Glossary

### TCDTI
The Territorial Community Digital Transformation Index – the calculable value that is determined as a result of the TC digital transformation and characterizes the dynamics of its development using predefined parameters.

### TCDTI tools
A set of tools—Excel tables—used to collect data and calculate the DTI.

### TC
Territorial Community – the basic administrative and territorial unit in Ukraine, formed by merging several settlements, whose center may be a city, a settlement, or village.

### Knowledge bases
A library containing specific recommendations for digital transformation specialists, cases of successful problem solving; regulatory support; descriptions of technologies, implementation guidance, etc.

### Subgroups
Areas that present the priorities in the TC digital development and are monitored within the Index.

### Indicators
Calculable elements of the structure, by which the TC digital transformation is monitored.

### Parameters
TC’s data that are collected from information holders and serve the base for calculating the indicators.

### Weight
The coefficient which determines the share of Index's structural elements (groups, subgroups, or indicators) in the higher-ranked structural elements in the hierarchy.

### Local government
Local self-governance body – TCs’ elected and other bodies empowered to resolve matters of local significance.

### MDT
The Ministry of Digital Transformation of Ukraine – the main body in the system of central executive bodies, which ensures the development and implementation of the state policies in such areas as digitalization, digital development, digital economy, digital innovations, e-government and e-democracy.

### ASC
Administrative Services Center – the local government’s effective working body, which provides administrative services through an administrator dealing with recipients of administrative services.

### CDTO
Chief Digital Transformation Officer of the Regional State Administration.

### Third parties
Ministries and government agencies—including their structural units—that are not subordinate to the Ministry of Digital Transformation and local governments and whose data are used to measure community indicators.

### GSEE
General Secondary Education Establishment – an educational establishment whose core activity includes educational activities in general secondary education у сфере загальної середньої освіти

### HCI
Healthcare institution – a legal entity of any legal form and ownership or its separate division, which provides healthcare services to the population under an appropriate license therefor through professional activities of medical (pharmaceutical) specialists and rehabilitation specialists.

### Business entity
A domestic or foreign legal entity of any form of ownership, as well as sole proprietors who carry out activities—goods production, service rendering, or trade—in Ukraine without creating a separate legal entity.

### KVED
(Ukrainian abbreviation for Ukrainian Classification of Economic Activities) A statistical tool for organizing economic information.

### PIT
Personal Income Tax – a tax collected from individuals or legal entities (taxpayers), which may vary depending on their obtained revenues or profit (taxable income).
01

About the Index
Introduction

How often should the Index be measured?
The measurement is performed annually. Based on the results of TCDTI measurement, the MDT's Measurement Team prepares a community rating to enable further analysis of these communities, ministries and government agencies as part of a comprehensive assessment of the state of digital transformation in the participating communities.

What is the purpose of the Index?
TCDTI is used to assess the level of digital transformation in the regions, aiming to further search for opportunities for the state to support digitalization processes therein, as well as to determine priority areas for digital development of communities and systematic implementation of e-governance, e-democracy tools, etc.

Who was the methodology developed by?
The methodology was developed by the Ministry of Digital Transformation in cooperation with the Eastern Europe Foundation within the implementation of the EGAP Program, and sponsored by Switzerland. Expert support and methodological support for the Territorial Community Digital Transformation Index Concept is provided by Deloitte.

Who is the Index owner?
The Territorial Community Digital Transformation Index was introduced by the Ministry of Digital Transformation of Ukraine to monitor the digitalization process in territorial communities.
**TCDTI structure**

Basic TCDTI and Extended TCDTI both include five identical groups of indicators, but vary in the number of indicators – 65 and 78, respectively. Basic TCDTI consisting of 65 indicators must be measured in small- and medium-sized communities (if necessary, the measurement may be performed for all communities). Extended TC DTI consisting of 78 indicators must be measured in significant and large communities (additional indicators for the measurement in more mature and developed communities).

**Why do Basic TCDTI and Extended DTI have different number of indicators?**

Some indicators considered within the Extended Index were excluded from the Basic Index due to the high risk of unavailability of certain measurement objects (parameters) in small- and medium-sized TCs, needed as the base for calculating these indicators. Thus, the Extended Index combines the entire list of indicators of the Basic Index (65 items) and additional indicators (13 items) for significant and large TCs.

---

**The structure of the Basic and the Extended TCDTI**

- **Digital economy in TC**
  - The TC's ability to ensure its development in the IT industry and contribute to the creation of a developed IT ecosystem in the territory of the community
  - 10% 15%

- **Development of digital skills**
  - Development and support of the TC's residents in the digitalization. Raising digital literacy of the population, and assistance for citizens who want to develop themselves in IT
  - 25% 20%

- **Digital infrastructure in TC**
  - Availability and operation of the infrastructure allowing the spread of digitalization and safe operation
  - 20% 25%

- **Digitalization of public services**
  - Ensuring that TCs receive services through digital channels that are convenient, omnichannel, user-friendly, secure, etc.
  - 25% 25%

- **Digital transformation of local governments**
  - Support for direct democracy functions and development of relevant tools ensuring the internal operation of local governments and digitalization within local governments
  - 20% 15%

---

**The number of indicators in the group/maximum score of the BASIC TCDTI**

- Total – 65 indicators /100 points
  - 11/10 points 7/25 points 12/25 points 17/25 points 18/20 points

**The number of indicators in the group/maximum score of the EXTENDED TCDTI**

- Total – 78 indicators /100 points
  - 13/15 points 7/20 points 13/25 points 24/25 points 21/15 points

In addition, there are indicators (18 items) for future measurement that are included neither in the Basic TCDTI not in the Extended TCDTI
### Classification of territorial communities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of TCs</th>
<th>Profitable TCs (FCI&lt;0.9*)</th>
<th>Subsidized TCs (FCI&lt;0.9*)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Small</td>
<td>&lt;10 k residents</td>
<td>&lt;10 k residents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium-sized</td>
<td>10-50 k residents</td>
<td>10-50 k residents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant</td>
<td>50 k residents</td>
<td>50 k residents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>the minimum number of residents in the regional center**</td>
<td>the minimum number of residents in the regional center**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Large</td>
<td>&gt; the minimum number of residents in the regional center**</td>
<td>&gt; the minimum number of residents in the regional center**</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Additional characteristic

TCs that are under occupation and TCs where active hostilities are taking place – no TCDTI measurement is performed.

Deoccupied TCs and TCs where the critical infrastructure has suffered significant destruction – the Basic TCDTI measurement is performed.

An additional characteristic to the selected option is temporarily applied and must be reviewed once a year (during monitoring of relevance and making changes to TCDTI).

* The parameter 0.9 was taken from Article 99 of the Budget Code of Ukraine
** The minimum number of residents in the regional center is determined based on the statistics data as of the start date of TCDTI measurement
Description of the TC digital maturity levels

**MEASUREMENT RESULTS RATING**

The rating is based on the total score obtained by the community for 66/79 indicators, depending on the index being measured. The maximum score a community can obtain is 100 points.

Each community is ranked in the index rating in comparison with other communities. If certain communities obtain the same score, they share their position in the rating.

Depending on the obtained score, the community determines its digital maturity, using the following score ranges:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Digital maturity levels</th>
<th>Score Ranges</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Transformational</td>
<td>91–100 points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proactive</td>
<td>71–90 points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perspective</td>
<td>51–70 points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic</td>
<td>31–50 points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Starting</td>
<td>0–30 points</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Use of the measurement results

The TCDTI is a tool for collecting, processing, and analyzing data on the communities' current digitalization level. The index is important as it enables the monitoring of the digital transformation progress. Regular digital transformation monitoring and assessment of territorial communities, which differ in: area, number of the residents, administrative status, economic indicators, is a valuable tool for ensuring stable progress in achieving the goals set by the Ministry of Digital Transformation of Ukraine regarding: digitalization of regions, timely and effective managerial decisions, coordination of actions being taken by all stakeholders. The TCDTI is used not only to track results achieved by TCs, but also to identify areas that require additional attention due to slow or no progress and possible reasons therefor, as well as to set priority areas for the community's digital development.

Why is the Ministry of Digital Transformation so serious about analyzing the DTI measurement results? The MDT monitors the implementation of the state's strategic goals by analyzing TCs' key indicators that, directly or indirectly, impact these goals.

2024 strategic goals

10% share of IT in the country's GDP
6 million Ukrainians to be involved in the digital skills development program
95% To cover the coverage with the high-speed internet
100% To make public services for the population of services to be transferred online

DTI structure

Digital economy in TC
Development of digital skills of the population
Digital infrastructure in TC
Digital transformation of public services
Digital transformation of local governments

Source: Goals of the Ministry of Digital Transformation of Ukraine by 2024
Use of the measurement results

Residents and potential residents
- Determining the life quality and working conditions in the territory
- Making informed decisions on changing residence
- Assessing the level of vulnerable groups’ digital inclusiveness and comfort of life

Business representatives
- Identifying the most efficient and attractive areas for implementing projects and locating assets
- Using TCDTI partly for the market analysis and/or the consumer sentiment analysis
- Accessing the systematized and analyzed information about the territories

Business, investors, and donors
- Assessing the return of investments or performance of support projects
- Identifying areas and opportunities for future cooperation with territorial communities

Mass media, public organizations, and researchers
- Studying the correlation of social phenomena
- Assessing the activities of state and local authorities
- Accessing systematized and analyzed information

State authorities
- to assess the level of the digitization’s development in communities which are differ in terms of territory, population, administrative status and geography
- for the development of NPAs that meet the standards of modernity and innovation
- to monitor the effectiveness of the use of state resources at the local level and the level of local authorities’ ability to adhere to state policy and fulfill their obligations
- for the distribution of resources intended for the implementation of digital transformation in communities

Heads of TCs, local governments
- Assessing the digitalization level and dynamics
- Using TCDTI as a basis for strategic planning of digitalization at the local level and responding to needs and changes in TC
- Establishing priority areas in digitalization for financing programs
- Making informed decisions and communicating with residents

The index provides a wide range of application options for various stakeholders
02

Index Measurement Stages
**General process map**

The term of implementation of all stages of measuring the Index is 142 working days. The implementation period is given in working days. This process map does not include an automation step.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stage 1</th>
<th>Stage 2</th>
<th>Stage 3</th>
<th>Stage 4</th>
<th>Stage 5</th>
<th>Stage 6</th>
<th>Stage 7</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Preparation for measuring the TCDTI</td>
<td>Kick-off meeting with TC (training session for TC coordinators)</td>
<td>Collection of indicators from TCs, government bodies, the first verification</td>
<td>TCDTI calculation, the second verification</td>
<td>Preperation of the rating and the results analysis</td>
<td>Presentation and implementation of the results</td>
<td>Exchange of expertise and TC digitalization best practices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>~26 days</td>
<td>~36 days</td>
<td>~18 days</td>
<td>~30 days</td>
<td>~22 days</td>
<td>~10 days</td>
<td>~40 days</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Key activities:**

- Create a TCDTI analytics team, appoint the measurement manager
- Develop a TCDTI measurement plan/road map
- Prepare presentation, training materials
- Create and promote measurement tools
- Post a press release
- Hold a training session for TC coordinators
- Develop a plan for communication between the participants of the index measurement
- Plan regular Q&A sessions for TCs to obtain their feedbacks
- Prepare and send a data request form/questionnaire to collect the collecting indicators from TCs and third parties
- Collect indicators (to be done by third parties)
- Provide the obtained indicators to the MDT's Measurement Team
- Verify the indicators collected and calculated (to be done by the MDT)
- Calculate the index and its structural elements for each TC according to the instructions
- Assign the digital maturity level to each TC (depending on the Index calculated)
- Analyze the results at the MDT level
- Analyze the results at the TC level
- Analyze the measurement results by key indicators, achievement of the MDT’s strategic goals
- Create a dashboard displaying the results of TCDTI measurement
- Present the TCDTI measurement results
- Conduct a campaign aimed to propagate best practices (including media coverage)
- Identify the priority areas in the development of TC
- Create a pool of practicing experts for exchanging experience between TCs (by digitalization areas)
- Create a database of successfully implemented TC projects
- Arrange for training sessions to transfer experience to TC representatives from leading foreign/domestic digitalization experts
- Stage 7 begins three months before the start of the next measurement
- Conduct a TCDTI relevance analysis
- Make changes to the structure/weights/approach and data verification methods (if necessary).

*The introduction of automation affects the amount of resource engagement at this and subsequent stages. In particular, human capital to meet the specified deadlines.*
Parties involved in the measurement process

**Index owner**
- Sets strategic goals for the project manager; provides the measurement manager with an analytics team, expert team, and consulting support; takes decisions on making changes to the measurement process and changes the composition of the parties involved in the measurement.

**Project Manager**
- Coordinates the measurement process and functions as a project manager, communicates with third parties, provides advisory and methodical support, records feedback.

**TC Facilitator**
- Provides communication with TC Coordinator and Measurement Team, as well as advisory and methodical support; checks that TCs provide information in a timely manner, records feedbacks from communities and initiates discussions with Measurement Team.

**Analytics team**
- Collects information, calculates the TCDTI and verifies data; carries out communications with TCs and third parties; prepares the rating and analyzes the results.

**TC’s Coordinator**
- Provides information at information requests, communicates directly with information owners; organizes the data collection process; participates in discussions with Project Team.

**Information Holders**
- Collect and verify data and enter information into request forms; prepare comments; communicate with the TC Coordinator / person responsible for collecting data from third parties.

**Expert Team**
- Participate in setting/changing weights and target values; provide advisory support to the parties involved in the measurement.
  (The team consists of both internal and external experts.)

**Responsible parties**
- Ministry of Digital Transformation of Ukraine
- CDTO
- Ministry of Digital Transformation of Ukraine
- Territory community
- Third parties
- Ministry of Digital Transformation of Ukraine
- Territory community
- Third parties
- Ministry of Digital Transformation of Ukraine
Data sources and collection principles

Data of territorial communities
- Data of structural units of local governments and utility companies (in particular, open source datasets, internal reporting, etc.), which must be collected and/or calculated using a single index methodology.

Data of the Ministry of Digital Transformation
- Data maintained by the Ministry of Digital Transformation, in Dilia, for example, analytics related to the use of public data, Digigram surveys, etc.

Other structures third party organizations and public register data
- Data used to calculate indicators (for example, the average X indicator for Ukraine) obtained from public registers, ministries and government agencies, including:
  - State Employment Service
  - State Tax Service
  - State Migration Service
  - Ministry of Education and Science

The data should be collected following the below principles:

- Reliability: Information must be collected from reliable sources that own such information or create it in carrying out their activities.
- Timeliness: Information must be collected in a timely manner, with minimal tolerable delays.
- Completeness: Information must fully cover the need.
- Regularity: Information must be collected on a regular basis and be available for collection in subsequent periods.
- Applicability: Information must be prepared so that it is ready for processing.
- Confidentiality: Information must ensure non-violation of effective laws of Ukraine regarding the preservation of confidential data, as well as banking, financial, and commercial secrets.
Measurement of the annual digital development dynamics

**Key aspects**

- The annual dynamics of digital development should be measured starting from the second year of the TCDTI measurement by comparing the TCDTI values for the current and previous years for each TC to determine the % of change.

- The measurement aims to determine the current state of digitalization of the community and to assess the speed of its transformation.

- There are four zones based on the TCDTI calculated for the current year and the determined annual dynamics. The dynamics is estimated as low or high (for example, if the % of changes is less than 20% - the dynamics is estimated as low; if the % of changes is more than 20% - the dynamics is estimated as high).

**4 types of communities in accordance with digital development**

- **Leaders** are TCs that demonstrate a high level of digitalization (the TCDTI score is more than 50) and rapid development.

- **Stable** this zone includes TCs that have reached medium and high levels of digitalization (the TCDTI score is more than 50) but demonstrate a slower development as compared to the previous year.

- **Active** this zone includes TCs that have a medium or low level of digitalization (the TCDTI score is less than 50) but demonstrate rapid development.

- **Challenging** this zone includes TCs that have a medium or low level of digitalization (the TCDTI score is less than 50) and demonstrate slow development.

For each type of TC (zone), data should be processed separately, with consideration of their size (large, significant, medium-sized, small).

TCs that appeared in Challenging need particular attention and communication with heads of such TCs to identify factors preventing these communities from achieving digitalization goals.

It is necessary to develop an action plan that includes expert assistance, funding, joint activities, setting priority areas for further development.

Getting of the majority of TCs into Stable can be a trigger for introducing new strategic areas of digitalization – making changes to the structure of the Index.

Getting most of TCs into Challenging can be a trigger for reducing the target values and revising the structure of the Index.
Preparation of the TC digital maturity rating

Assign the digital maturity level to each TC (depending on the Index calculated)

Description of the TC digital maturity model

The TC digital transformation rating includes the measurement of the current digital maturity level of each community and a description of the main stages of digital transformation, the sequence of ICT implementation, and priorities for allocating TCs' resources in this journey.

There is a five-step assessment of TC digital maturity for different qualification groups:

- Large and significant cities – based on the results of the Extended Index measurement
- Medium-sized and small towns – based on the results of the Basic Index measurement

The TC’s digital maturity level is determined as a total sum of DTI points, depending on the type of the index being measured.

There are five TC digital maturity levels with the following score ranges:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Score Range</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Transformational</td>
<td>91 to 100 points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proactive</td>
<td>71 to 90 points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perspective</td>
<td>51 to 70 points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic</td>
<td>31 to 50 points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Starting</td>
<td>0 to 30 points</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Description of the TC digital maturity levels

01 Transformational
TC is characterized by a high level of digitalization in all areas covered by the Index, has a strong track record of successfully implemented digitalization projects in TCs' social areas, ensures sufficient information security and quality indicators.

02 Proactive
TC is implementing a digitalization program and actively cooperating with residents to promote digitalization, has good indicators of publicity and transparency of the local government, and is attractive for investments in IT.

03 Perspective
TC has average scores in most subgroups of the Index and demonstrates progress in digital transformation in almost all areas covered by the Index.

04 Basic
TC is preparing organizational and methodological support for the implementation of digitalization. The local government is involved in the development of digital skills of the population. TC has certain achievements in enhancing the quality and accessibility of the information infrastructure.

05 Starting
TC has certain achievements in digitalization of public services for the population and is carrying out a transformation in its local government, has embarked on the implementation of digital tools in TCs' social areas: education, medicine, health and safety, etc.
Ongoing monitoring of TCDTI
Timing: 40 days

The frequency of comprehensive monitoring of the TCDTI relevance
1 a year

The start date of the monitoring of the TCDTI relevance
3 months before the TCDTI measurement starts

The end date of the monitoring of the TCDTI relevance
1 month before the next TCDTI measurement starts

The TCDTI approach to updating

The main triggers for making changes to the TCDTI include but not limited to the following:
- Changes in the strategic goals of the Ministry of Digital Transformation of Ukraine
- Giving priority to the implementation of the MDT’s short-term tasks related to the digital development
- Achieving of the set target indicators by all TCs or most of TCs
- Possibility to collect data for calculating indicators in For Future Measurement
- Other

The monitoring of TCDTI components may result in the following changes:
1. Adding/deleting/merging: groups, subgroups, indicators within Basic TCDTI and Extended TCDTI
2. Redistribution of importance weights: groups, subgroups and indicators of TCDTI
3. Adjustment of the approach to and methods of verifying TCDTI parameters and indicators
4. Change in how resulting TCDTI is displayed on the dashboard

Participants
TCDTI owner
Consultation Team:
- TCDTI project manager
- Person responsible for calculating the TCDTI
- TC coordinators
- External and internal experts

All changes introduced must be:
1. Approved by the TCDTI Owner and documented,
2. Explained to all stakeholders of the TCDTI measurement (if necessary)
Refined Structure of the Index
International and domestic analysis

The structure of the TCDTI was brought in line with the strategic goals of the Ministry of Digital Transformation, TC's digital transformation best practices, and regulations governing the countrywide digitalization.

**Step 1. Building of the structure of the TCDTI**

The proposed structure of the TCDTI is comprehensive, with almost all of its subgroups being covered by the analyzed international practices. In addition, it was updated to meet the needs of digital transformation, current laws and regulations and current risks in Ukraine.

Most of indices that ensure comprehensive measurement of digital transformation at the international level are fully covered by the groups measuring the business environment, digital skills of the population, digitalization of services provided by authorities, and the digitalization level of the infrastructure.

**Step 2. Preparation of the list of indicators**

For further testing and adjusting the list of indicators, the TCDTI structure that was built based on the results of the analysis was further detailed using sets of indicators. The list of indicators was extended with indicators to measure the digitalization of services for vulnerable groups, including internally displaced persons.
Hierarchical structure of TCDTI

**01 SUBGROUPS**

The number of subgroups in the group is proportional between the groups of the TCDTI to ensure a balanced and comprehensive measurement of TC's digital transformation.

**02 INDICATORS**

Quantitative indicators for measuring the calculable parameters that can be measured and calculated in numerical values.

Qualitative indicators for measuring non-calculable parameters that cannot be measured and expressed in numbers or counted.

If there is no data for measurement, the indicator falls in For Future Measurement.

**03 PARAMETERS**

Indicator values must be up-to-date, relevant, and reliable.

These parameters must be collected in accordance with applicable laws and from the specified sources of information.

---

**STRUCTURAL ELEMENTS OF THE INDEX**

- **Groups**: Thematic sets of indicators grouped by related spheres of TC digitalization.

- **Subgroups**: Areas that present the priorities in the TC digital development and are monitored within the Index.

- **Indicators**: Calculable elements of the structure, by which the TC digital transformation is monitored.

- **Parameters**: TC's data that are collected from information holders and serve the base for calculating the indicators.
Basic TCDTI and Extended TCDTI

**Basic TCDTI** consisting of 65 indicators must be measured in small- and medium-sized communities (if necessary, the measurement may be performed for all communities)

**Extended TCDTI** consisting of 78 indicators must be measured in significant and large (additional indicators for the measurement in more mature and developed communities)

---

**Indicators**

- By data sources
  - **Quantitative indicators**: These indicators are calculated using TC’s quantitative data, financial statements, and other statistical data.
    - 47 indicators
    - 57 indicators
  - **Qualitative indicators**: These indicators are obtained based on TC’s qualitative parameters and represent a scored estimate of the measured parameters.
    - 18 indicators
    - 21 indicators

- By types
  - **For mandatory measurement**: Gives the base for calculating the TCDTI.
    - 65 indicators
    - 78 indicators
  - **For future measurement**: Included in the TCDTI structure, but not measured at the current stage. These indicators may be measured after certain conditions are met.
    - 18 indicators

---

Parameters are the basic elements of the TCDTI used as the base for calculating indicators.
The total number of indicators is 199, of which 140 come from local government agencies and 59 come from other ministries and services.
TCDTI Groups and Subgroups

TCDTI is a set of 96 indicators structured by 16 subgroups within 5 groups

1. Digital economy in TC
   - Development of IT companies in TC
   - Investment attractiveness of the IT industry
   - Digital technologies for business
   - Total number of Indicators: 11
   - Group weight in Basic TCDTI: 10%
   - Group weight in Extended TCDTI: 15%

2. Development of digital skills
   - Development of digital literacy of the population
   - Development of ICT talent
   - Total number of Indicators: 11
   - Group weight in Basic TCDTI: 25%
   - Group weight in Extended TCDTI: 20%

3. Digital infrastructure in TC
   - Cybersecurity
   - Creation of a digitally safe environment
   - Quality and accessibility of the digital infrastructure
   - Total number of Indicators: 15
   - Group weight in Basic TCDTI: 20%
   - Group weight in Extended TCDTI: 25%

4. Digitalization of public services
   - Vulnerable groups
   - Digital development of education and healthcare services
   - Digital development of public services for the population
   - Digitalization of the transport infrastructure
   - Total number of Indicators: 25
   - Group weight in Basic TCDTI: 25%
   - Group weight in Extended TCDTI: 25%

5. Digital transformation of local governments
   - Automation of management activities and resource management systems
   - Institutional capacity
   - Publicity and transparency of local governments / e-democracy tools
   - Online resources of local governments
   - Total number of Indicators: 25
   - Group weight in Basic TCDTI: 20%
   - Group weight in Extended TCDTI: 15%
## Extended TC and Basic TC DTI

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GROUP</th>
<th>SUBGROUP</th>
<th>Extended TCDTI</th>
<th>Basic TCDTI</th>
<th>For future measurement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Digital economy in TC</td>
<td>Development of IT companies in TC</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Investment attractiveness of the IT industry</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Digital technologies for business</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of digital skills of the population</td>
<td>Development of digital literacy of the population</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Development of ICT talent</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Digital infrastructure in TC</td>
<td>Cybersecurity</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Creation of a digitally safe environment</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Quality and accessibility of the digital infrastructure</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Digitalization of public services</td>
<td>Vulnerable groups</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Digital development of education and healthcare services</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Digital development of public services for the population</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Digitalization of the transport infrastructure</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Digital transformation of local governments</td>
<td>Automation of management activities and resource management systems</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Institutional capacity</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Publicity and transparency of local governments/e-democracy tools</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Online resources of local governments</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total number of TCDTI</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>78</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TCDTI structure: subgroups in Digital Economy in TC

TC's ability to ensure the development of IT and to facilitate the creation of a well-developed IT ecosystem across its territory

Development of IT companies in TC
- Number of IT enterprises
- TC's budget revenues from payment of PIT and single tax by business entities operating in IT
- Proceeds from export and domestic consumption of IT services/goods
- Number of new jobs created in IT
- Average salary in the IT industry
- Number of created startups

Investment attractiveness of the IT industry
- Attracting capital investments in the IT industry
- Number of workplaces in IT hubs, which can be rented by IT specialists
- Availability and relevance of information about TC's investment objects
- The number of HEI and college graduates specialized in IT

Digital technologies for business
- Provision of online services to business
- Effectiveness of rendering services to business
- Incentives for developing entrepreneurship in TC
TCDTI structure: subgroups in Development of Digital Skills

- **Development of digital literacy of the population**
  - Raising of TC population's digital literacy (skills and knowledge)
  - Creation of favorable conditions to increase the reach by digital technologies
  - Use of online registration services on the Dilia portal
  - Availability and use of smartphones and/or tablets by the population of TC's residents

- **Development of ICT talent**
  - Knowledge development of schoolchildren in information and communication technologies (ICT)
  - Promoting the development of infrastructure of digital literacy education
TCDTI structure: subgroups in Digital Infrastructure in TC

Availability and operation of the infrastructure allowing the spread of digitalization and safe operation

**Quality and accessibility of the digital infrastructure**
- Broadband coverage and access
- Creation of an IT infrastructure to enable the operation of ASC remote workplaces
- Provision of local government and educational establishments with modern computer equipment

**Cybersecurity**
- Timely response of systems to cyber incidents
- Cybersecurity/cyber hygiene awareness sessions for TC's local government and residents
- Upgrading the software at the local government

**Creation of a digitally safe environment**
- Integrated video surveillance coverage, public notification of emergencies or incidents
- Operating air quality monitoring systems
TCDTI structure: subgroups in Digitalization of Public Services

Ensuring that TCs receive services through digital channels that are convenient, omnichannel, user-friendly, secure, etc.

Vulnerable groups

- Availability and use of the ASC mobile suitcase
- Creation of an infrastructure for people with visual/hearing disabilities (regulated pedestrian crossings, vehicles with audio information devices, etc.)
- Provision of IDPs with useful information/links on the TC portal

Digital development of education and healthcare services

- Possibility of online registration for kindergartens
- Provision of schools with STEM/STEAM-labs and computer equipment
- Online appointment with family doctors

Digital development of public services for the population

- Provision of administrative services to the population through digital channels and Dilia Centers
- Provision of ASC with equipment for QR-validation in Dilia/reading of ID cards
- IVR system for information exchange

Digitalization of the transport infrastructure

- Implementation of interactive stops tracking, creation of online public transport stops maps
- Support for the implementation of e-tickets and related solutions
- Implementation of parking payment solutions
TCDTI structure: subgroups in Digital Transformation of Local Governments

Support of direct democracy functions, development of relevant tools ensuring the internal operation of local governments, digitalization within local governments

- Automation of management activities and resource management systems
  - Implementation of an electronic document management system for local government, public bodies and institutions
  - Implementation of energy saving and energy efficiency monitoring systems for communally owned facilities

- Institutional capacity
  - Development and implementation of an informatization program
  - Availability of a functional unit responsible for digital transformation of TC
  - Availability of a leader responsible for digital transformation of TC

- Publicity and transparency of local governments/e-democracy tools
  - Support for the implementation of e-democracy tools: petitions, public budget, open budget, etc.
  - Increasing publicity and transparency using digital tools
  - Ensuring greater involvement of the population through digital channels in communication with local governments

- Online resources of local governments
  - Availability of a public geoportal of TC
  - Open access to tourist information and cultural events on local government resources
  - Compliance of the local government's official website with the Dila design code
Approaches to weighting TCDTI groups and indicators. Determination of their target values.
Setting weights and target values

Weight setting/changing model

Create an expert team
The weights are determined through a survey of the Expert Team aimed to establish the priority of the indicator and each group. For proper determination of weights, it is recommended to involve a group of 5 to 10 participants.

Conduct a survey
Conducting a survey of the Expert Team for each indicator and group - closed voting. Questionnaires are sent to participants who rate all questions from 1 to 5 (1 - less important, 5 - most important).

Calculate the weight
The Measurement Team calculates the weight. Each rate is converted into a score according to the Fibonacci number series. The final score of the indicator is calculated by the formula $B_f = \frac{\text{sum of points}}{\text{MIN}(B) - \text{MAX}(B)}$, where MIN(B) and MAX(B) are the minimum and maximum scores, respectively. If the minimum and maximum points are more than one, only one minimum and one maximum point is deducted.
The indicator weight is calculated by the formula: $\text{Indicator} = \frac{\text{Final indicator score}}{\text{sum of final scores of all task indicators}} \times 100\%$.

Making changes to the methodology and tools
Making changes to the methodology and tools for the indicators and groups whose weights have changed.

Target values setting/changing model

Convene the Measurement Team
The target values are set through the involvement of the Measurement Team.

Hold a discussion and set targets
The Measurement Team meets to discuss and set target values. These will be optimal values agreed upon by the majority of the team members. For certain indicators, it may be required to involve internal and external experts to set their target values.
Target values should be realistic and achievable. In case there is no starting point to set the target value logically, it is recommended to set a higher value than the projected one, keeping in mind that this indicator may hardly be achieved in practice.

Making changes to the methodology and tools
Making changes to the methodology and tools for the indicators and groups whose weights have changed.

Monitor and make adjustments
The target values are revised annually, at the monitoring stage, in case of:
- changes in the Index structure at the level of indicators and/or groups; for example, when one of the indicators is removed or added because its target value has been achieved;
- changes in the priority development areas;
- relevant decision of the Expert Team based on the measurement results.
Annex 01. Recommendations on Risks Management
# Recommendations on risks management

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#</th>
<th>Description of risks</th>
<th>Risk level</th>
<th>Recommendations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Risk of unavailability of the parties involved in the measurement due to martial law/epidemiological situation/dismissal of employees/vacations</td>
<td></td>
<td>Identify back-up experts to participate in the measurement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Risk of data inaccuracy</td>
<td></td>
<td>Conduct a mandatory verification at the level of TC and third parties</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Risk of insufficient communication and the local government’s low interest in the measurement</td>
<td></td>
<td>Appoint responsible coordinators at the local government level, develop a communication plan and regulations to use the index, hold a kick-off meeting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Errors in names of files for collecting indicators from TCs and third parties</td>
<td></td>
<td>Reconcile the data file names with the same stored in the libraries of TCs and third parties; automate this process in the future</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Risk of breaking deadlines for collecting and processing data related to the indicators due to insufficient resources in TCs</td>
<td></td>
<td>Prior communication with TCs to establish a realistic timeframe to collect data</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 6  | The risk of obtaining information from third parties in an inappropriate format/structure or without specifying the TCs |            | 1. Agree with third parties on the structure, form, channel and terms of providing information  
  |   |                                                                                        |            | 2. Ensure that data are structured by TCs before submitting them to the Ministry of Digital Transformation |
| 7  | Risk of insufficient resources for collecting/processing/validating data from TCs and third parties |            | 1. Engage a sufficient number of Measurement Team members  
  |   |                                                                                        |            | 2. Automate collection, validation, and consolidation of information for further measurement |
| 8  | Risk of breaking the measurement timeframes due to insufficient automation of collection of indicators and the visualization tool (dashboard) for measurement results |            | 1. Engage a sufficient number of Analytics Team members  
  |   |                                                                                        |            | 2. Automate collection, validation, and consolidation of information for further measurement |
| 9  | Risk of data unavailability in most TCs and/or third parties                          | Low        | 1. Exclude the indicator from the calculation of the Index  
  |   |                                                                                        | Medium     | 2. Reserve for future measurement |

**Risk level:**  
- Green: Low  
- Yellow: Medium  
- Red: High
Annex 02. Pilot Measurement Results
Five TCs of the TCDTI testing

Who are the Pilot measurement participants?

For the purpose of testing the TCDTI, we selected pilot TCs of different types (zones, sizes) and located in different geographies:

1 large – Dnipro TC
1 significant – Kolomya TC
1 medium-sized – Pyriatyn TC
2 small – Shatsk TC, Butsk TC

What outcomes are expected from the Pilot?

01
Testing of the TCDTI methodology and, if required, making changes and adjustments to:
- List of indicators
- Calculation formulas
- List of indicators
- and others
- Indicator components

02
Identification of bottlenecks and obstacles in obtaining the information necessary to measure the progress of TC in the future

03
Searching for ways and sources of obtaining information in the future

The size of the territorial community:
Small – up to 10 k residents
Medium-sized – 10 k to 50 k residents
Significant – 50 k to 115.5 k residents
Large – more than 115.5 k residents

Fiscal Capacity Index (FCI):
Profitable – FCI >0.9
Subsidized – FCI<0.9

What is the Pilot measurement timeline?

Implementation of Stream 1: Collection of indicators from TCs to determine 29 indicators of DTI
Implementation of Stream 2: Collection of indicators from TCs to determine 84 indicators of the DTI
Preparation of the final list of DTI indicators
Determinaton of Basic DTI and Extended DTI

1 2 3 4
10 days 12 days 4 days 2 days

* The minimum number of residents in the regional center is determined based on the statistics data as of the start date of TC DTI measurement (115.5 k residents as of 23 Feb 2021)
### Results of the pilot TCDTI testing in five territorial communities for 2021

100 is the maximum score for mandatory quantitative indicators for which the pilot testing was performed

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TC</th>
<th>Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dnipro TC</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kolomya TC</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pyriatyn TC</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Butsk TC</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shatsk TC</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Dnipro TC**: Large

**Kolomya TC**: Significant

**Pyriatyn TC**: Medium-sized

**Butsk TC**: Small

**Shatsk TC**: Small

---

**Impact of groups on the resulting index**

*Pilot testing was performed to check the basic scoring approach. Some indicators were not included in the pilot measurement. The graphs present the weighted results by the groups. Given the different weights of groups, the data reflect the impact of each group on the index, but cannot be used to compare different groups among themselves.*
The TC's digital maturity level

Key conclusions:

Most of the TCs that took part in the pilot measurement obtained the TCDTI results indicating a Basic and Starting level of maturity.

Small TCs have a lower level of digitalization compared to other communities in the pilot measurement; this may be due to a lower demand for digitalization in such communities given they have a smaller number of residents.

The largest scores are obtained by TCs in groups that measure the digitalization level in the public sector (provision of public services, functioning of the local government).

Groups that measure the digitalization level in the areas that involve the interaction with the local government and are not directly impacted by the local government (the level of digital skills of TC's residents and the level of digitalization of business) have lower scores compared to other subgroups.
#DigitizeUkraine